Criticisms of Williams

Nozick

1. Is it true of *all* goods? Should everything be distributed according to its nature? If so, that seems ridiculous, barbering example.

2. Are individuals responsible for the distribution? If so, limits on liberty objectionable.

> "The major objection to speaking of everyone's having a right *to* various things such as equality of opportunity, life, and so on, and enforcing this right, is that these "rights" require a substructure of things and materials and actions; and *other* people may have rights and entitlements over those. No one has a right to something whose realization requires certain uses of things and activities that other people have rights and entitlements over. Other people's rights and entitlement to *particular things* (*that* pencil, *their* body, and so on) and how they choose to exercise these rights and entitlements fix the external environment of any given individual and the means that will be available to him. (p. 238)"

Menzel

1. Even non-hypochondriacs can always buy more health care. E.g. technologies to address possible future problems, ways of extending life at the end.

2. Spending more on health care means spending less on other things.

3. The rich and the poor have different priorities. E.g. the rich may be satisfied with their schools and roads while the poor are not.

> "… caring about any particular person whose liver or heart fails involves wishing that he or she, too, could receive the miracle of a transplant. But so stated, that caring is highly abstracted from the person's total condition, including his or her modest income. In caring about this full, real, low-income person whose liver fails, what should one want? The morally most sensitive caring would seem to involve an imaginative process in which one puts oneself in his or her shoes. But once one takes that crucial step, the case for equality of care is destroyed. If one really were the patient and could control the use of the accessible resources, one certainly would not include liver transplants in one's chosen health plan. (p. 122)"